Mr Karmenu Vella  
EU Commissioner for Environment, Maritime Affairs and Fisheries  
European Commission  
Rue de la Loi, 200  
1049, Brussels  

December 7, 2017

Subject: European Commission’s public consultation on ivory trade in the European Union (EU)

Dear Commissioner Vella,

We are writing as a concerned group of scientists in response to the current EU consultation on ivory regulations, to urge you to close down the EU’s domestic ivory market.

Over the past 30 years, Africa’s elephant population has fallen from about 1.2 million to around 415,400, as reported by the IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group. Scientists overwhelmingly agree that a primary cause of these worrying declines is the illegal killing of elephants for their ivory. In September 2016, the IUCN confirmed that “Africa’s overall elephant population has seen the worst declines in 25 years, mainly due to poaching over the past ten years”. Elephants are iconic, awe-inspiring animals and perform critical ecological roles in the forests and savannahs they inhabit. However, current poaching levels pose a risk to their survival; their numbers are dropping by 8-9% annually both in the forest and the savannah. Unless this poaching trend is halted, African elephants will continue to disappear across large areas of their range within our lifetime.

We commend the European Commission for developing an EU Action Plan against Wildlife Trafficking, which we believe sets out a comprehensive blueprint for joined-up efforts to fight wildlife crime including through further limits on ivory. However in the case of elephant ivory, we consider that the only solution is for the EU to close its market. Studies of trade in elephant ivory indicate that legal markets provide a cover for trade in illegal products and undermine enforcement efforts. The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), for instance, concluded: “the trade in illicit ivory is only lucrative because there is a parallel licit supply, and ivory can be sold and used openly. Ivory would lose much of its marketability if buying it were unequivocally an illegal act, or if ownership of these status goods had to be concealed”.

This link between the legal and illegal trade also exists in the EU – the world's largest exporter of legal ivory – where traffickers exploit regulatory loopholes in order to misrepresent illegal ivory as legal ivory. Furthermore, most of the ivory seized in the EU in 2016, amounting to more than 2.5 tonnes and representing the biggest volume seized in recent years, was on its way to Asia – the world’s largest market for illegal ivory – demonstrating a link between the EU’s illegal ivory trade and international ivory trafficking. The illegal ivory trade is more than a conservation issue: it exacerbates conflict, corruption, and poverty in countries that are already struggling to defend their economic and national security. Given the scale of the current elephant poaching crisis across Africa, and the modus operandi of the trade, the EU must eliminate its parallel legal and illegal markets and the resulting opportunities for laundering illegal ivory.

Closing the EU’s domestic ivory market will also send important signals to other consumer countries and give the EU added credibility when asking other countries to close their own domestic markets. Thank you for the high level of attention and ambition you have given to tackling wildlife trafficking and we look forward to further global leadership from the EU on this critical issue.
Sincerely,

Katharine Abernethy, Ph.D.
University of Stirling
Stirling, UK

Mark Abrahams, Ph.D.
Bristol Zoological Society
Bristol, UK

Ricardo Antunes, Ph.D.
Wildlife Conservation Society
Glasgow, UK

Mark Auliya, Ph.D.
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research
- UFZ
Leipzig, Germany

Lis Bach, Ph.D.
Aarhus University
Aarhus, Denmark

Andrew Balmford, Ph.D.
University Cambridge
Cambridge, UK

Jean-Francois Bastin, Ph.D.
ETH-Zurich
Zurich, Switzerland

Elke Bellefroid, M.Sc.
Botanic Garden Meise
Meise, Belgium

Maíra Benchimol, Ph.D.
Universidade Estadual de Santa Cruz
Ilhéus, Brazil

Elizabeth L. Bennett, Ph.D.
Wildlife Conservation Society
Bronx, NY, USA

Roseline C. Beudels-Jamar de Bolsée, Ph.D.
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Stephen Blake, Ph.D.
Saint Louis University
St. Louis, MO, USA

Luigi Boitani, Ph.D.
Sapienza University of Rome
Rome, Italy

Iosif Botetzagias, Ph.D.
University of the Aegean
Mytilini, Greece

Robin Brabant, M.Sc.
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Nils Bunnefeld, Ph.D.
University of Stirling
Stirling, UK

Colin Chapman, Ph.D.
McGill University
Montreal, Canada

Tara Chapman, Ph.D.
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Nicolas Cichocki, Ph.D. Candidate
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research
- UFZ
Leipzig, Germany

Esther Clarke, Ph.D.
Trunks & Leaves
Newton, MA, USA

Tom Clements, Ph.D.
Wildlife Conservation Society
Cambridge, UK

Lauren Coad, Ph.D.
Center for International Forestry Research
Cambridge, UK
Peter Coppolillo, Ph.D.
Working Dogs for Conservation
Bozeman, MT, USA

Mona Court-Picon, Ph.D.
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Andrew A. Cunningham, Ph.D.
Zoological Society of London
London, UK

Joshua H. Daskin, Ph.D.
Yale University
New Haven, CT, USA

Sarah Dawson, Ph.D.
Franklin and Marshall College
Lancaster, PA, USA

Anisha Dayaram, Ph.D.
Leibniz Institute for Zoo and Wildlife Research
Berlin, Germany

Petra De Block, Ph.D.
Botanic Garden Meise
Meise, Belgium

Charles De Cannière, Ph.D.
Université Libre de Bruxelles
Brussels, Belgium

Shermin de Silva, Ph.D.
Trunks & Leaves Inc
San Diego, CA, USA

Maria del Carmen Fleytas, M.Sc.
Wildlife Conservation Society
Asunción, Paraguay

Pierre Devillers, Ph.D.
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Ilaria Di Silvestre, M.Sc.
Eurogroup for Animals
Brussels, Belgium

Alex Diment, Ph.D.
Wildlife Conservation Society
Yangon, Myanmar

Sarah Durant, Ph.D.
Zoological Society of London; Wildlife Conservation Society
London, UK

Derek Elsby, Ph.D. Candidate
University of the Highlands and Islands
Thurso, UK

Johan Espunyes, M.Sc.
Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona
Barcelona, Spain

Matthew Evans, Ph.D.
University of Hong Kong
Hong Kong, China

Kate Farr, Ph.D.
University of Wolverhampton
Wolverhampton, UK

Aluane Ferreira, M.Sc.
Universidade Estadual de Santa Cruz
Ilhéus, Brazil

Vicki Fishlock, Ph.D.
Amboseli Trust for Elephants; University of Stirling
Nairobi, Kenya

German Forero, Ph.D.
Wildlife Conservation Society
Cali, Colombia

Johannes Förster, Ph.D. Candidate
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research - UFZ
Leipzig, Germany

Martin C. Funes, M.Sc.
Wildlife Conservation Society
Junin de los Andes, Argentina

Louise Gibson, M.Sc.
Zoological Society of London
London, UK
Peter Gilbert, Ph.D.  
University of the Highlands and Islands  
Thurso, UK

Heidi C. Hauffe, Ph.D.  
Fondazione Edmund Mach  
Mezzocorona, Italy

Michale Glennon, Ph.D.  
Wildlife Conservation Society  
Saranac Lake, NY, USA

Nancy C. Hawkes, Ph.D.  
Woodland Park Zoo  
Seattle, WA, USA

Kathleen S. Gobush, Ph.D.  
University of Washington; Paul G. Allen Philanthropies  
Seattle, WA, USA

Klaus Henle, Ph.D.  
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research - UFZ  
Leipzig, Germany

Arnaud Goessens, M.Sc.  
Wildlife Conservation Society  
Brussels, Belgium

Heribert Hofer, Ph.D.  
Leibniz Institute for Zoo and Wildlife Research  
Berlin, Germany

Quentin Goffette, M.Sc.  
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences  
Brussels, Belgium

Ilse E. Hoffmann, Ph.D.  
University of Vienna  
Vienna, Austria

Elizabeth Greengrass, Ph.D.  
Born Free Foundation  
Horsham, UK

Oliver Höner, Ph.D.  
Leibniz Institute for Zoo and Wildlife Research  
Berlin, Germany

Oliver Griffin, M.Sc.  
Wildlife Conservation Society  
Phnom Penh, Cambodia

Graziella Iossa, Ph.D.  
University of Lincoln  
Lincoln, UK

Kim Gruetzmacher, Ph.D. Candidate  
Free University Berlin; Wildlife Conservation Society  
Berlin, Germany

Natalija Ivdra, M.Sc.  
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research - UFZ  
Leipzig, Germany

Amy Haigh, Ph.D.  
University College Dublin  
Dublin, Ireland

Seth Jackson, M.Sc.  
Zoological Society of London  
London, UK

Katharina Halbach, M.Sc.  
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research - UFZ  
Leipzig, Germany

Anne Jähkel, M.Sc.  
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research - UFZ  
Leipzig, Germany

Rebecca Harris, Ph.D.  
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research - UFZ  
Leipzig, Germany

Devcharan Jathanna, Ph.D.  
Wildlife Conservation Society  
Bengaluru, India

Stephen Harris, D.Sc.  
Retired  
Bristol, UK

Kathryn Jeffery, Ph.D.  
University of Stirling  
Stirling, UK
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution/University</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bethan Morgan, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Zoological Society of San Diego</td>
<td>Edinburgh, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cynthia Moss, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Amboseli Trust for Elephants</td>
<td>Nairobi, Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elena Motivans, M.Sc.</td>
<td>German Centre for Integrative Biodiversity Research</td>
<td>Leipzig, Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jochen Mueller, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research - UFZ</td>
<td>Leipzig, Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kristin Mühldorfer, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Leibniz Institute for Zoo and Wildlife Research</td>
<td>Berlin, Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elizabeth N. Muthiani, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Kenya Agricultural and Livestock Research Organization</td>
<td>Nairobi, Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarun Nair, M.Sc.</td>
<td>Ashoka Trust for Research in Ecology and the Environment</td>
<td>Bangalore, India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aaron Nicholas, M.Sc.</td>
<td>Wildlife Conservation Society</td>
<td>Iringa, Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ken Norris, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Zoological Society of London</td>
<td>London, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katarzyna Nowak, Ph.D.</td>
<td>University of the Free State</td>
<td>Qwaqwa, South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthew Nuttall, M.Sc.</td>
<td>University of Stirling</td>
<td>Stirling, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darcy Ogada, Ph.D.</td>
<td>The Peregrine Fund</td>
<td>Nairobi, Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sébastien Olive, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences</td>
<td>Brussels, Belgium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah Olson, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Wildlife Conservation Society</td>
<td>Bronx, NY, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lilian Painter, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Wildlife Conservation Society</td>
<td>La Paz, Bolivia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzanne Palminteri, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Mongabay</td>
<td>Washington, D.C., USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olivier S. G. Pauwels, M.Sc.</td>
<td>Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences</td>
<td>Brussels, Belgium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlos Peres, Ph.D.</td>
<td>University of East Anglia</td>
<td>Norwich, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nathalie Pettorelli, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Zoological Society of London</td>
<td>London, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Camille Pisani, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences</td>
<td>Brussels, Belgium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joyce H. Poole, Ph.D.</td>
<td>ElephantVoices</td>
<td>Sandefjord, Norway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Powell, Ph.D.</td>
<td>World Wildlife Fund</td>
<td>Washington, D.C., USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer B. Pramuk, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Woodland Park Zoo</td>
<td>Seattle, WA, USA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Georg Teutsch, Ph.D.
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research
- UFZ
Leipzig, Germany

Valentine Thiry, Ph.D. Candidate
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Stephanie Thomas, Ph.D.
University of Bayreuth
Bayreuth, Germany

Macarena Toll Riera, Ph.D.
University of Zurich
Zurich, Switzerland

Hendrik Trekels, Ph.D.
Vrije Universiteit Brussel
Brussels, Belgium

Jenny Tschoertner, M.Sc.
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research
- UFZ
Leipzig, Germany

Stefano Vaglio, Ph.D.
University of Wolverhampton; Durham University
Wolverhampton, UK

Yoo R. Van Bourgonie, M.Sc.
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Josh Van Buskirk, Ph.D.
University of Zurich
Zurich, Switzerland

Marijke van Kuijk, Ph.D.
Utrecht University
Utrecht, The Netherlands

Maarten P. M. Vanhove, Ph.D.
Finnish Museum of Natural History, University of Helsinki
Helsinki, Finland

Erik Verheyen, Ph.D.
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Robert Wallace, Ph.D.
Wildlife Conservation Society
La Paz, Bolivia

Eva Warns-Petit, Ph.D.
Direction Départementale de la Protection des Populations (DDPP)
Ploufragan, France

Samuel K. Wasser, Ph.D.
University of Washington
Seattle, WA, USA

James Watson, Ph.D.
University of Queensland; Wildlife Conservation Society
Brisbane, Australia

Janice Weatherley-Singh, Ph.D. Candidate
Wildlife Conservation Society; Wageningen University & Research
Brussels, Belgium

Renate Wesselingh, Ph.D.
Université catholique de Louvain
Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium

Nathan Whitmore, M.Sc.
Wildlife Conservation Society
Goroka, Papua New Guinea

Rosie William, Ph.D. Candidate
Zoological Society of London
London, UK

Leslie Wilmet, Ph.D. Candidate
Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences
Brussels, Belgium

Steffen Zacharias, Ph.D.
Helmholtz Centre for Environmental Research
- UFZ
Leipzig, Germany
Ivory that has been poached on elephants after 1947 is being sold in the UK as antique ivory. It is not always easy to identify modern, post 1947 ivory, and ivory literally dipped in tea to stain the piece. According to WWF’s UK chief adviser on wildlife, Heather Sohl “We have evidence that ivory, which dates from after 1947 is being sold in the UK as antique ivory. It is not always easy to identify modern, post 1947 ivory, and ivory has been poached on elephants before 1947. Some pieces of ivory are tea-stained to make it look older. They are literally dipped in tea to stain the piece”. A report by the UK House of Commons published on January 30, 2017, states that “illegal ivory items seized by police and the Border Force in the UK have been falsely antiqued, using artificial stains or ageing techniques, clearly destined for the legal antique market”, available at http://researchbriefings.files.parliament.uk/documents/CDP-2017-0034/CDP-2017-0034.pdf (page 18).


